

Principal-Agent Problem and Dynamic Programming

Dylan Possamaï

Université Paris Dauphine, France

Joint work with J. Cvitanić and N. Touzi

ICASQF, Cartagena, June 16, 2016

Outline

- 1 The Principal-Agent Problem
- 2 Review of stochastic control of Markov diffusions
- 3 A first look at the uncontrolled diffusion case
 - BSDE Characterization
 - Controlled diffusion case : difficulties
- 4 Diffusion control and 2BSDEs
 - Introducing 2BSDEs
 - Solving the Principal-Agent Problem
 - A sub-optimal Principal problem
 - Reducing the Principal problem to standard control

Output process

- **Effort** = Control process $\nu = (\alpha, \beta)$ with values in $A \times B$.
- **Output** = the controlled state process in \mathbb{R}^d : any weak solution \mathbb{P} of the (non-Markovian) SDE

$$dX_t = \sigma_t(X, \beta_t) [\lambda_t(X, \alpha_t) dt + dW_t].$$

where W is a Brownian motion with values in \mathbb{R}^n .

- Observation of X does not give access to the drift $\sigma\lambda$.
- Observation of X gives access to $\sigma\sigma^\top$ but not to σ .

The Agent problem

Agent solves the following control problem :

$$V_0^A(\xi) := \sup_{\mathbb{P}} \mathbb{E}^{\mathbb{P}} \left[\underbrace{e^{-\int_0^T k_s(X, \nu_s^{\mathbb{P}}) ds}}_{\text{Discount}} \underbrace{\xi(X)}_{\text{Salary}} - \int_0^T \underbrace{e^{-\int_0^t k_s(X, \nu_s^{\mathbb{P}}) ds}}_{\text{Discount}} \underbrace{c_t(X, \nu_t^{\mathbb{P}})}_{\text{Cost}} dt \right],$$

where the contract $\xi(X)$ is \mathcal{F}_T -measurable, and represents the compensation for the management of X .

→ No interest on X , except for the compensation ξ indexed on X .

Path-dependency of ξ is crucial \implies **Non-Markovian stochastic control**

The Principal problem

Moral hazard : Principal chooses the optimal compensation scheme $\xi(X)$ based on the observation of X only, i.e. Principal does not observe the Agent effort.

Principal solves the optimization problem

$$V_0^P := \sup_{\xi \in \Xi_R} \mathbb{E}^{\mathbb{P}^*(\xi)} \left[U(\ell(X_T) - \xi) \right]$$

- $\ell(X_T)$: liquidation value of the output.
- $\mathbb{P}^*(\xi)$: optimal solution of Agent problem given the contract ξ .
- Ξ_R : collection of all ξ , such that $V_0^A(\xi) \geq R$ (reservation utility, participation constraint).

Existing literature

- Non-zero sum Stackelberg game, highly nonlinear problem ;
- Mainly static or discrete time problems : *Spear & Srivastava, Salanié, Tirole, Laffont, Martimort, Radner, Jofre,...* \implies very general but limited computations ;
- Extension to **continuous time models** : *Holmström & Milgrom, Schättler, Williams, Sung, Sannikov, Cvitanić & Zhang, Ekeland,...* ;
- Main method for general problems : calculus of variations \implies Pontryagin Maximum Principle leading to a system of Forward-Backward SDEs...
- **Our objective** : Simple solution by standard dynamic programming.

Outline

- 1 The Principal-Agent Problem
- 2 Review of stochastic control of Markov diffusions
- 3 A first look at the uncontrolled diffusion case
 - BSDE Characterization
 - Controlled diffusion case : difficulties
- 4 Diffusion control and 2BSDEs
 - Introducing 2BSDEs
 - Solving the Principal-Agent Problem
 - A sub-optimal Principal problem
 - Reducing the Principal problem to standard control

Stochastic control of Markov diffusions

Probability space $(\Omega, \mathcal{F}, \mathbb{P})$, filtration \mathbb{F} , $W : \mathbb{R}^n$ –Brownian motion.

- Control process : $\nu = \{\nu_t, t \geq 0\}$ \mathbb{F} –progressively measurable process with values in $U \subset \mathbb{R}^k$.
- Controlled state process X^ν , valued in \mathbb{R}^d , defined by the SDE

$$dX_t^\nu = b(t, X_t^\nu, \nu_t)dt + \sigma(t, X_t^\nu, \nu_t)dW_t.$$

- \mathcal{U} : admissible controls, i.e. X^ν well-defined, appropriate regularity.
- Control problem :

$$V(t, x) := \sup_{\nu \in \mathcal{U}} \mathbb{E} [g(X_T^{t,x,\nu})].$$

Hamiltonian and the HJB equation

- Hamiltonian :

$$H(t, x, z, \gamma) := \sup_{u \in U} \left\{ b(t, x, u) \cdot z + \frac{1}{2} \sigma \sigma^\top(t, x, u) : \gamma \right\},$$

for all $(t, x) \in [0, T] \times \mathbb{R}^d$ and $(z, \gamma) \in \mathbb{R}^d \times \mathcal{S}_{\mathbb{R}}(d)$. Then,

The value function V solves the Dynamic Programming (Hamilton-Jacobi-Bellman) Equation :

$$\begin{aligned} \partial_t V + H(t, x, DV, D^2 V) &= 0, & t < T, & x \in \mathbb{R}^d, \\ V(T, \cdot) &= g & \text{on } \mathbb{R}^d. \end{aligned}$$

In which sense does HJB equation hold ?

- **Classical sense** : $V \in C^{1,2}([0, T], \mathbb{R}^d)$... Not expected, many counter-examples.
- **Sobolev solutions** : $V \in W^{1,2}([0, T], \mathbb{R}^d)$ (Krylov 1980), very developed in the semilinear case (that is with uncontrolled diffusion)...
- **Viscosity solutions** (Crandall & Lions '81, Lions '83...) : **No access to optimal control, in general.**

To sum up...

- Easy extension to running costs and discounting.
- Gives a lot of hindsight into the corresponding non-Markovian control problems.
- Dynamic programming approach to characterize optimal controls (necessary for Principal problem!) → need to have at least some weak notion of regularity.

Outline

- 1 The Principal-Agent Problem
- 2 Review of stochastic control of Markov diffusions
- 3 A first look at the uncontrolled diffusion case
 - BSDE Characterization
 - Controlled diffusion case : difficulties
- 4 Diffusion control and 2BSDEs
 - Introducing 2BSDEs
 - Solving the Principal-Agent Problem
 - A sub-optimal Principal problem
 - Reducing the Principal problem to standard control

The Agent's Problem

- Output now becomes

$$dX_t = \sigma_t(X) [\lambda_t(X, \alpha_t) dt + dW_t],$$

with associated weak solution \mathbb{P}^α .

- Agent solves :

$$\sup_{\alpha} \mathbb{E}^{\mathbb{P}^\alpha} \left[e^{-\int_0^T k_s(X, \alpha_s^{\mathbb{P}^\alpha}) ds} \zeta(X) - \int_0^T e^{-\int_0^t k_s(X, \alpha_s^{\mathbb{P}^\alpha}) ds} c_t(X, \alpha_t^{\mathbb{P}^\alpha}) dt \right].$$

- The \mathbb{P}^α form a **dominated** family.

The Agent's Problem

- For any admissible α , let

$$V_t^{A,\alpha} := \mathbb{E}_t^{\mathbb{P}^\alpha} \left[e^{-\int_t^T k_s(X, \alpha_s^{\mathbb{P}^\alpha}) ds} \xi(X) - \int_t^T e^{-\int_t^s k_r(X, \alpha_r^{\mathbb{P}^\alpha}) dr} c_s(X, \alpha_s^{\mathbb{P}^\alpha}) ds \right].$$

- Then

$$e^{-\int_0^t k_s(X, \alpha_s^{\mathbb{P}^\alpha}) ds} V_t^{A,\alpha} - \int_0^t e^{-\int_0^s k_r(X, \alpha_r^{\mathbb{P}^\alpha}) dr} c_s(X, \alpha_s^{\mathbb{P}^\alpha}) ds,$$

is a \mathbb{P}^α -martingale.

The Agent's Problem

- By martingale representation, there is some predictable Z^α , and some martingale M^α orthogonal to W with

$$V_t^{A,\alpha} = \xi(X) + \int_t^T f_s(X, V_s^{A,\alpha}, Z_s^\alpha, \alpha_s^{\mathbb{P}^\alpha}) ds - \int_t^T Z_s^\alpha \cdot \sigma_s(X) dW_s - \int_t^T dM_s^\alpha,$$

where

$$f_t(x, y, z, \alpha) := -c_t(x, \alpha) - k_t(x, \alpha)y + \sigma_t(x)\lambda_t(x, \alpha) \cdot z.$$

- **Linear Backward SDE** (Pardoux & Peng '91, El Karoui, Peng & Quenez '97, El Karoui & Huang '97...)!

The Agent's Problem

- Using the ideas of Hamadène and Lepeltier ('95) and El Karoui and Quenez ('95), by comparison theorem for BSDEs, we have

$$V_t^A = \xi(X) + \int_t^T F_s(X, V_s^A, Z_s) ds - \int_t^T Z_s \cdot \sigma_s(X) dW_s - \int_t^T dM_s,$$

where

$$F_t(x, y, z) := \sup_{\alpha} f_t(x, y, z, \alpha),$$

is the Hamiltonian associated to the problem of the Agent !

- If F is Lipschitz and ξ and $F_t(x, 0, 0) \in L^p$, then wellposedness is ensured.

The Agent's Problem : conclusion

- Optimal control of Agent is given by any \mathbb{P}^{α^*} where α^* attains the sup in F .
- This requires only **integrability** assumptions on ξ , λ and σ .

The case of controlled diffusion : difficulties

- Similar to the Markov case, very difficult to access to the Hessian component... **Need a relaxation of the C^2 -regularity.**
 - The \mathbb{P}^ν 's (measures induces by the controlled state) are defined on different supports for different values of ν , so **can not reduce the analysis to one single measure.**
- ⇒ **Quasi-sure stochastic analysis** : stochastic analysis under a non-dominated family of singular measures.

Outline

- 1 The Principal-Agent Problem
- 2 Review of stochastic control of Markov diffusions
- 3 A first look at the uncontrolled diffusion case
 - BSDE Characterization
 - Controlled diffusion case : difficulties
- 4 Diffusion control and 2BSDEs
 - Introducing 2BSDEs
 - Solving the Principal-Agent Problem
 - A sub-optimal Principal problem
 - Reducing the Principal problem to standard control

From fully nonlinear HJB equation to semilinear

- $H_t(x, y, z, \gamma)$ non-decreasing and convex in γ , Then

$$H_t(x, y, z, \gamma) = \sup_{a \geq 0} \left\{ \frac{1}{2} a : \gamma - H_t^*(\omega, z, a) \right\}.$$

- HJB equation is

$$\partial_t v + \sup_{a \geq 0} \left\{ \frac{1}{2} a : \partial_{xx}^2 v - H_t^*(x, v, \partial_x v, a) \right\} = 0.$$

- Stochastic representation

$$v_t = \sup_a Y_t^a,$$

where,

$$Y_t^a = \xi - \int_t^T H_s^*(Y_s^a, Z_s^a, a_s) ds + \int_t^T Z_s^a dX_s, \quad \mathbb{P}^a - \text{a.s.}$$

Wellposedness of second order BSDEs

There exists a unique triple (Y, Z, K) \mathbb{F} -adapted with **appropriate integrability**, such that

- $Y_t = \xi - \int_t^T H_s^*(Z_s, a_s) ds - \int_t^T Z_s dX_s + \int_t^T dK_s, \mathbb{P}^a\text{-a.s.},$
for all control process $a,$

- K nondecreasing, $K_0 = 0,$ and $\inf_a \mathbb{E}^{\mathbb{P}^a} [K_T] = 0.$

- Cheredito, Victoir, Soner, Touzi, Zhang, Matoussi, Neufeld, Nutz, P., Tan, Zhou.

Regularity reduces to the non-decreasing process K

Suppose $K_t = \int_0^t \dot{K}_s ds$, $t \in [0, T]$, and define the process Γ by

$$\dot{K}_t = H_t(Y_t, Z_t, \Gamma_t) - \frac{1}{2} a_t : \Gamma_t + H_t^*(Y_t, Z_t, a_t),$$

Substituting in the 2BSDE, we get for all a :

$$Y_t = \xi + \int_t^T \left[H_s(Y_s, Z_s, \Gamma_s) - \frac{1}{2} a_s : \Gamma_s \right] ds - \int_t^T Z_s dX_s, \mathbb{P}^a - \text{a.s.}$$

\implies Use this as natural class of contracts !

A class of revealing contracts

- For $Y_0 \in \mathbb{R}$ and Z, Γ \mathbb{F}^X -prog meas, define

$$Y_t^{Z, \Gamma} = Y_0 + \int_0^t Z_s \cdot dX_s + \frac{1}{2} \int_0^t \Gamma_s : d\langle X \rangle_s - \int_0^t H_s(X, Y_s^{Z, \Gamma}, Z_s, \Gamma_s) ds$$

Proposition $V_0^A(Y_T^{Z, \Gamma}) = Y_0$ and any maximizer of the Hamiltonian $(a^*, b^*)(Y, Z, \Gamma)$ induces a solution $\mathbb{P}^{*, Z, \Gamma}$ of the Agent problem

Sub-optimal stochastic control problem

- Under $\mathbb{P}^{*,Z,\Gamma}$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} dX_t &= \sigma_t^*(X, Y_t, Z_t, \Gamma_t) [\lambda_t^*(X, Y_t, Z_t, \Gamma_t) dt + dW_t], \\ dY_t^{Z,\Gamma} &= Z_t \cdot dX_t + \frac{1}{2} \Gamma_t : d\langle X \rangle_t - H_t(X, Y_t^{Z,\Gamma}, Z_t, \Gamma_t) dt, \end{aligned}$$

where $\sigma_t^*(\omega, y, z, \gamma) := \sigma_t(\omega, b^*(\omega, y, z, \gamma))$, $\lambda_t^*(\omega, y, z, \gamma) := \dots$

$$V_0^P \geq \sup_{Y_0 \geq R} \underline{V}_0(X_0, Y_0); \quad \underline{V}_0(X_0, Y_0) := \sup_{Z,\Gamma} \mathbb{E}^{\mathbb{P}^{*,Z,\Gamma}} \left[U(\ell(X_T) - Y_T^{Z,\Gamma}) \right]$$

- \underline{V} characterized by standard HJB equation

The general case

- In the fully nonlinear case, the representation $\xi = Y_T^{Z, \Gamma}$ not true for general ξ ... We only have the 2BSDE representation :

$$Y_t = \xi - \int_t^T H_s^*(Y_s, Z_s, a_s) ds - \int_t^T Z_s dX_s + \int_t^T dK_s, \quad \mathbb{P} - \text{a.s. for all } \mathbb{P},$$

with K nondecreasing, $K_0 = 0$, and $\inf_{\mathbb{P}} \mathbb{E}^{\mathbb{P}}[K_T] = 0$

- It is sufficient to find an approximation ξ^ε of ξ such that $\xi^\varepsilon = Y_T^{Z^\varepsilon, \Gamma^\varepsilon}$... and pass to the limit in the Principal problem...

The general case

- $K_t^\varepsilon := \frac{1}{\varepsilon} \int_{0V(t-\varepsilon)}^t K_s ds$ and $\xi^\varepsilon := Y_T^\varepsilon$ (replacing K by K^ε) \implies
 $\xi^\varepsilon = Y^{Z, \Gamma^\varepsilon}$ and \mathbb{P}^* optimal for K is also optimal for K^ε .

$$\implies V_0^P = \sup_{Y_0 \geq R} \underline{V}_0(X_0; Y_0).$$

Thank you for your attention !